Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

# NursingPlus Open

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/npls

Research article

# The effects of a structured mindfulness program on the development of empathy in healthcare students



Nursing Plus

Sue Dean<sup>a,\*</sup>, Maralyn Foureur<sup>b</sup>, Chris Zaslawski<sup>c</sup>, Toby Newton-John<sup>d</sup>, Nickolas Yu<sup>e</sup>, Evangelos Pappas<sup>f</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Faculty of Health, University of Technology Sydney, PO Box 123, Broadway, Sydney 2007, Australia

<sup>b</sup> Faculty of Health, University of Technology Sydney, Level 8, 235 Jones Street, Ultimo 2007, Australia

<sup>c</sup> Faculty of Science, University of Technology Sydney, PO Box 123, Broadway 2007, Australia

<sup>d</sup> Graduate School of Health, University of Technology Sydney, Level 4, Building 7, 67 Thomas Street, Ultimo 2007, Australia

e Program Manager Patient & Family –centred care and staff wellness, Sydney Local Health District, Level 11 North KGV Building, 83-117 Missenden Road,

#### 1. Introduction

A growing body of literature demonstrates that high levels of anxiety and stress-related health concerns are experienced by undergraduate university students, in particular medical and nursing students). Beddoe and Murphy (2004); Irving, Dobkin, and Park (2009); Hassed (2009); Shapiro (2005); Darling (2007); Candy (2011). For students to become effective healthcare professionals it is important that they have the mental and emotional skills to manage stress. Mindfulness training has been found to reduce stress in a variety of populations (Hassed, 2016; Kabat-Zinn, 2016). The benefits of mindfulness training for student populations extend beyond stress reduction (Hassed, 2016). and include improved concentration and attention, faster information processing which enables better academic performance (Mrazek, 2013) greater self-reflexivity, and increased student engagement (Napoli & Bonifas, 2011). Mindfulness furthermore assists students to develop self-awareness and emotional regulation which enables greater perspective-taking and empathy (Grant, 2014; Hassed, 2016).

## 2. Empathy in health practitioner- patient relationships

Empathy, in relation to health care professionals, has been defined as a cognitive attribute that allows an understanding of the experience, concerns, and perspectives of a patient, as well as the ability to communicate that understanding (Hojat, 2013). Empathy has been recognised as being at the centre of the therapeutic process (Colliver, 2010; Spiro, 2009) and it is also considered to be the defining characteristic of all health professions (Larson & Yao, 2005). And some suggest that it is a health care practitioners 'most powerful tool' (Hegazi & Wilson, 2013). Empathy has been named as an essential learning objective by the American Association of Medical Colleges and it is believed to significantly influence patient satisfaction, adherence to medical recommendations, clinical outcomes and professional satisfaction (Hojat, 2002; Hong, 2012; Stepien & Baernstein, 2006). Furthermore, there is now evidence to support the benefits of education and training to develop empathy in health care professionals (Larson & Yao, 2005; Stepien & Baernstein, 2006). There is no doubt that responding appropriately to the emotional states of a patient produces positive outcomes in the patient-practitioner relationship (Epstein & Street, 2007). To respond appropriately, health practitioners must demonstrate that not only have they accurately recognised the psychological dimension of the patient's state but also that they are able to respond in a way that understands and validates the feelings experienced (Wilson, Prescott, & Becket, 2012).

Mindfulness practice facilitates awareness and being in the present moment, empathically acknowledging one's experience and encouraging critical examination of personal biases while withholding judgment (Birnie, Speca, & Carlson, 2010). Mindfulness practice further enables enhanced attention to what is in the present moment and an 'open heart', attitudes/practices which are fundamental to empathy (Beddoe & Murphy, 2004). Mindfulness practices have been shown not only to enhance the characteristics of empathy and compassion but are pre - requisite for these characteristics to 'take root' (Birnie et al., 2010). In studies where empathy in particular was measured as an outcome in health care providers, levels of empathy improved following a mindfulness intervention (Lamothe, 2016). If we are able to encourage students undertaking health care studies to acknowledge their own experience in a non-judgmental and compassionate way and to listen actively with an 'open heart' it follows that when working with clients as graduate health care workers they may be more authentic and empathic (Carson & Langer, 2006).

\* Corresponding author.

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.npls.2017.02.001

Received 16 November 2016; Received in revised form 31 January 2017; Accepted 20 February 2017



Camperdown 2050, Australia

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>f</sup> Faculty of Health Sciences, The University of Sydney, 75 East Street, Lidcome 2141, Australia

*E-mail addresses:* Sue.dean@uts.edu.au (S. Dean), Maralyn.foureur@uts.edu.au (M. Foureur), Chris.zaslawski@uts.edu.au (C. Zaslawski), Toby.newton-john@uts.edu.au (T. Newton-John), Nickolas.yu@sswahs.nsw.gov.au (N. Yu), Evangelos.pappas@sydney.edu.au (E. Pappas).

<sup>2352-9008/ © 2017</sup> The Authors. Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/BY-NC-ND/4.0/).

# 3. Effective health-care practitioner and patient communication

In all health disciplines, effective communication is the cornerstone of practice and there is considerable evidence that communication is a key element in producing positive outcomes for health care workers and patients (Bensing, Rimondini, & Visser, 2013; Charon, 2007; Epstein & Street, 2007; Parry, 2008; Street, 2009). The ability to communicate effectively is increasingly recognised as critical to success in the health care system. Effective communication involves arriving at a shared understanding of a situation and in some cases a shared course of action. This requires a range of communication skills including listening actively and responding empathically and being able to apply these skills across a range of contexts and situations (Stein-Parbury, 2014). In order to listen actively the health care worker must listen with an open mind, stay focussed on the client's message and resist judgment – all fundamental to mindfulness.

## 4. The practice of traditional Chinese medicine

The present study was carried out in a large Metropolitan University in Australia, with students enrolled in a Bachelor of Health Science in Traditional Chinese Medicine (TCM), a complementary medicine modality.

The use of complementary medicine is said to be increasing worldwide (Adams, 2012; Barnes, 2012; Fonnebo, 2007; Kim, 2012; Kitai, 1998) and one of the reasons proposed for patients using complementary therapists instead of conventional doctors is that complementary and alternate therapists are believed to be better communicators (Bishop, Yardley, & Lewith, 2010; Michlig, Ausfeld-Hafter, & Busato, 2008). Poor communication between health care professionals and patients has been implicated in the increasing number of complaints against health care professionals worldwide and interventions to improve patient - practitioner communication have included enhancing practitioners' empathy (General Medical Council GMC, 2012; Health Care Complaints Commission, 2015; Iedema, 2012).

# 5. Purpose

The objective of this study was to evaluate the effect a structured mindfulness based program on the development of empathy in the undergraduate TCM students.

# 6. Methods

## 6.1. Design

This was a prospective, non-randomised observational study which utilised a repeated measure (JSE-HPS) before and after participation in a 12 week mindfulness-based program. For this study the outcome measure was the 20-item Jefferson Scale Empathy- Health Profession Students' (JSE-HPS) version (Hojat, 2007). This is a validated instrument that measures self-reported levels of empathy in students from healthcare professions (Fields, 2011; Fjortoft, Van Winkle, & Hojat, 2011). It uses a seven-point Likert scale with the descriptors of "strongly disagree" at one end of the scale and "strongly agree" at the other end. The psychometric qualities of the JSE-HPS were evaluated in an Australian student sample where it was shown to be a valid and reliable measure for undergraduate student empathy levels (Williams & Stickley, 2010). In the current study it was used to assess the effect of a structured series of mindfulness experiences on empathy levels in the students over a period of a 12 week academic semester. The scale was administered at the beginning (week one) and also at the completion of the semester (week 14). Participants also answered a brief questionnaire regarding their experience of the mindfulness

program (Slavik, 2014). Ethical approval for the study was obtained from the Human Research Ethics Committee of the university. Prior to gaining consent from the students, an information sheet was given explaining the aim of the project, outlining their right to refuse to participate without penalty and asking them to sign a consent form if they wished to participate.

Questionnaires were distributed and collected by an academic who was not part of the teaching team for the subject and who did not deliver the mindfulness program. Students were asked to complete them anonymously and they were collected in an unidentified envelope for collation.

All students enrolled in the subject (n=57) agreed to participate and it was interesting to note that whilst lectures for the subject were compulsory students were advised that if they wished to attend the lecture and not attend the mindfulness exercises that they wouldn't be penalised. There was 100% attendance for every week's mindfulness exercise.

#### 6.2. Participants

Of the 57 students who participated in the study, 30 (53%) were female and 22 (39%) were male with five participants not recording their gender. All were first year undergraduate students with a mean age of 30 years (range 19–51 years).

#### 6.3. Data collection

Data were collected during the Australian Spring academic semester (March to June 2014).

# 6.4. Mindfulness training

The mindfulness program was a structured weekly program involving a variety of experiences based on the development of mindfulness skills. The exercises and activities were facilitated by two experienced mindfulness meditation teachers with fifteen years of experience each (NY, TS). For the purposes of the present study, there was a particular focus on the engenderment of empathy through mindful awareness. During the first week, a two-hour workshop was facilitated where mindfulness and mindfulness meditation were explained. Mindfulness was placed in a context and evidence was provided to support the benefits of mindfulness practices in tertiary education settings. Students were encouraged to ask questions and to share their previous experiences of meditation if they wished to. As many of the students were mature age, often with undergraduate degrees in fields other than health or from Eastern cultural traditions, many had previous experience with some sort of mindfulness, meditation, yoga or tai chi for example. The program for the mindfulness exercises was developed by one of the facilitators of the mindfulness exercises who chose a variety of exercises considered relevant to the students. Following the introduction students were led through a body scan and breathing meditation. For the following eleven weeks at the commencement of the scheduled two hour 'Communication for The Complementary Therapist' lecture, students were introduced to a different mindfulness practice for approximately 15-20 min. This was followed by a 15-20 min debriefing session that solicited verbal feedback about the experience, and a discussion of how the activity might be utilised in the student's personal and/or professional life as a health care practitioner.

On the final session, in addition to completing the JSE-HPS, students were invited to reflect on their experiences and complete a short questionnaire (Table 1). This measure asked participants to describe their experiences of participating in the exercises each week and if they thought the weekly exercises had any impact on their learning. Each of the 15 items in the questionnaire represented an indicator of the broad benefits of mindfulness (questions 2,4,6,7,11,12,14) or discreet benefits of mindfulness in the context of

#### Table 1

Question 1: Pa	rticipation in th	e mindfu	lness-ba	sed prac	tice at the	ne start	of class
1 2	3 4	5	6	7	8 8	9 9	10 10 class
Question 2: Pa	rticipation in th	e mindfu	lness-ba	sed prac	tice at th	ne start (	of class
helped me e	engage with the	moment					
1 2	3 4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Question 3: Pa	rticipation in th	e mindfu	lness-ba	sed prac	tice at th	ne start (	of class
1 2	3 4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Question 4: Pa	rticipation in th	e mindfu	lness-ba	sed prac	tice at tl	ne start (	of class
1 2	3 4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Question 5: Pa	rticipation in th	e mindfu	lness-ba	sed prac	tice at th	ne start (	of class
improved n	ny ability to con	centrate a	ind proc	ess info	rmation		10
1 2	3 4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Question 6: Pa decreased n	rticipation in th ny stress and an	e mindfu xiety	lness-bas	sed prac	tice at tl	ne start (	of class
1 2	3 4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Question 7: Pa	rticipation in th	e mindfu	lness-ba	sed prac	tice at th	ne start (	of class
1 2	3 4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Question 8: Pa	rticipation in th	e mindfu	Iness-bas	sed prac	tice at tl	ne start (	of class
1 2	3 4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Question 9: Pa	rticipation in th	e mindfu	lness-ba	sed prac	tice at tl	ne start (	of class
helped me l	be more open to 3 4	learning 5	6	7	8	9	10
Question 10: P	articipation in t	he mindf	ulness-b	ased pra	actice at	the start	of class
helped me t	to be more refle	ctive					
1 2	3 4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Question 11: Participation in the mindfulness-based practice at the start of class							
1 2	3 4	5	6	7	8	9	10
1 <u>-</u>	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			, 			10 
Question 12: P	connect to cours	ne minar se content	uiness-D	ased pra	ictice at	the start	of class
1 2	3 4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Question 13: P	Participation in t	he mindf	ulness-b	ased pra	actice at	the start	of class
1 2	3 4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Question 14 Pa	articipation in th	ne mindfu	ilness-ba	sed pra	ctice at t	he start	of class
helped me l	be more self-awa 3 4	are 5	6	7	8	9	10
Question 15: Participation in the mindfulness-based practice at the start of class							
helped me l 1 2	be more aware o 3 4	of others 5	6	7	8	9	10
Deflecting on the	mindfulness he	and much				moted a	leese engu

The 15 item mindfulness-based practices in the classroom questionnaire (Slavik, 2014).

Reflecting on the mindfulness-based practices in which you participated, please answer the following statements with 1 being "not at all" and 10 being "to a high degree". Please indicate the degree to which the following statements are true.

higher education (questions 1,3,5,8,9,10,13,15) as evidenced in the literature (Diefenderfer, 2015). Students were asked to rate the statements on a scale of 1-10 with 0 indicating "not at all" and 10 "to a high degree" as to the extent to which the statement was true.

#### 6.5. Data analysis

Data were tabulated into a spreadsheet and then transferred into SPSS (version 21, SPSS Inc, Chicago, IL) for statistical analysis. Data were checked for normality and found to be normally distributed. An

#### Table 2:

Mean scores (pre and post the introduction of the mindfulness program) for the Jefferson Scale Empathy- Health Profession Students' (JSE-HPS) version.

Mean pre-intervention score (standard deviation)	Mean post- intervention score (standard deviation)	P value
93.2 (24.8)	109.1 (13.8)	p < 0.001

ANOVA (general linear model) was computed to evaluate the effect of the mindfulness training on empathy as well as for any significant differences attributed to gender. The significance level was set a priori at  $\alpha$ =0.05. Descriptive data are also presented for the questionnaire on the students' experience of the mindfulness program.

# 7. Results

# 7.1. JSE-HPS

The results from the JSE-HPS shown in Table 2 found a statistically significant increase in the overall mean empathy score from 93.2 (SD=24.8) prior to the commencement of the program to 109.1 (SD=13.8) at the completion of the program indicating increased levels of self-reported empathy (p < 0.001).

Analysis of the 20 individual questions on the JSE-HPS revealed that there was a mean increase in scores for all questions ranging from 0.45 for question 14 ("I believe that emotion has no place in the treatment of medical illness") to 1.57 for question 9 ("Health care providers should try to stand in their patients shoes when providing care to them").

Male participants experienced an increase of 19.5 points in the empathy score (from a mean pre score of 90.7 to a mean score of 110.2), while female participants commenced with a mean score of 100.2 and completed the study with a mean score of 108.9; a total change of only 8.7 points. This is also highlighted by the non-overlapping 95% confidence intervals (CI) between pre and post scores for males (pre 95%CI=80.6–100.7 and post 95%CI=104.1–116.2) while for females they were overlapping (pre 95%CI=91.6–108.8 and post 95%CI=103.7–114.0). However, this interaction effect of gender\* and time did not reach statistical significance (p=0.163). There was also no main effect for gender (p=0.288).

#### 7.2. Mindfulness experience questionnaire

On analysing the results from the post program questionnaire (Table 1) on the student experience throughout the semester, all 15 questions scored above seven (mean score 7.63; range 7.1- 8.1). This indicates that there was a high level of agreement that the students experienced broad advantages from participating in the embedded mindfulness program within the subject as well as discreet benefits from undertaking mindfulness training in the context of higher education.

# 8. Discussion

The results indicate that the introduction of a structured program of mindfulness was successful in engendering higher levels of empathy in Australian undergraduate students of Chinese medicine across 12 weeks of practice. Chinese medicine, while a relatively new health profession outside of Asia, is similar to many of the established health professions in that empathy is an important aspect of a therapeutic relationship (Coutinho, Silva, & Decety, 2014; Hojat, 2013; Parkin, de Looy, & Farrand, 2014).

#### 8.1. Empathy and gender

The difference in scores for the genders was also of interest. This is consistent with data reported for other health profession students. There is evidence of a 'gender gap' in levels of empathy among students in health care programs. Female students demonstrate higher empathy scores than their male counterparts in a variety of courses and cultures (Fields, 2011; Hegazi & Wilson, 2013; Hsiao, Tsai, & Kao, 2013; Kataoka, 2009a; Wen, 2013; Wilson et al., 2012).

Other studies using an earlier version of the scale used in this study, the Jefferson Scale of Physician Empathy Student version, found female medical, nursing and pharmacy students had significantly higher empathy scores than their male counterparts (Hegazi & Wilson, 2013; Hojat, 2007; Kataoka, 2009b; Wilson et al., 2012). A similar gender difference in favour of female students was found for 613 Taiwanese nursing students (Hsiao et al., 2013) and 265 nursing students at a public university in the south eastern part of the USA (Fields, 2011). Females were also shown to have higher levels of empathy in a Japanese study of 400 medical students across six years of their medical program (Kataoka, 2009a). There are data available, however, to support the trend from the data in the present study that female students start out with higher levels of empathy (Hojat, 2007; Kataoka, 2009a). The higher levels of empathy in females generally have been attributed to gender role expectations and socialization as well as evolutionary gender characteristics (Hojat, 2002, 2007). Similarly, we observed that males, even though they started at a lower baseline of empathy, they experienced greater increases after the training when both genders achieved similar scores. This is an important preliminary finding as it demonstrates the potential of mindfulness training to close the empathy "gender gap" among health care professionals.

One important issue that was not addressed was whether empathy can be maintained over the period of health professional training. While this study showed a significant increase in JSE-HPS scores, it is of course important to assess whether this can be maintained over time. Some studies have found empathy scores to be maintained over a five year period of medical education (Hegazi & Wilson, 2013) while others have shown a decline (Hojat, 2009, 2004).

The decline in empathy has been attributed to students' exposure to the clinical setting, particularly with medical students as their exposure to patients in real life settings usually occurs mid-way through their university programs. Further, traditional medical programs often don't introduce communication skills training until later in the course (Hojat, 2004). The students in this study were introduced to communication skills training and mindfulness during their first semester at university. They were also introduced to clinical environments in their first semester where they completed 25 h of supervised practice with patients in the public TCM clinic attached to the university. This is different from most of the studies on students in other health profession courses where the focus on communication and the exposure to clinical environments begins later. Further data need to be obtained from these students as they progress through their programs and have increasing amounts of time interacting with patients in clinical settings, to evaluate if empathy was maintained in this cohort.

The place of empathy in both teaching programs and professional practice is a hot topic amongst health profession educators. Empathy is recognised as perhaps the greatest intervention a health professional can have (Campbell, 2012; Larson & Yao, 2005). Not only is empathy considered fundamental to the establishment of a positive relationship between a health care practitioner and a patient, it has been embraced more broadly in the public sphere. Barrack Obama, for example, made empathy one of his major campaign themes in the lead-up to the 2008 election, stating that the empathy deficit should be more of a concern than the federal financial deficit (Krznaric, 2014). Educators should address the development and maintenance of empathy in training our

future health care workforce. Increasingly, individuals are seeking health care from complementary and alternate therapists based on their perceived ability to communicate and "care". Modern Western health care with its emphasis on technology and evidence- based practice often results in the "person" and empathy, going largely ignored in what are mostly scientific pursuits (Spiro, 2009).

Further, tertiary education curricula is often content-heavy, particularly in professional courses which are accredited by professional registration authorities, where graduates are required to meet certain competencies. The emphasis is often on teaching students to be competent rather than capable (Napoli & Bonifas, 2011) and this often doesn't leave enough time in the curriculum to facilitate the 'soft' skills essential for effective interpersonal communication. A recent report (Oliver, 2011) on good practice in assuring graduate outcomes suggested that academics appeared to place greater emphasis on general knowledge and less on interpersonal competency. Mindfulness introduced into curricula may be a cost effective way to provide students with the interpersonal skills essential to ease them into positive practices to assist them during their studies and beyond into their professional practice.

There were a number of limitations with the present study. First, it was not a controlled study, in that there was no historical or control group for comparison. Hence the changes observed in participants may have come about as a result of their progression through their course, rather than due to the specific effects of mindfulness training. Future studies should consider using mediation analysis in similar studies in order to identify the relationship between mindfulness training and the development of empathy during a semester long course. Secondly, the number of participants was not large (n=57) and consideration should be given to designing a more strongly powered study in the future. Finally, it only evaluated the effect of mindfulness on one health profession, that of Chinese medicine. It is possible that this profession may have a bias towards accepting meditation practice compared to more orthodox allied health professions such as medicine or nursing.

# 9. Conclusion

This study has shown that empathy can be increased over a 12 week period when mindfulness practice is embedded within a curriculum. Healthcare educators should give consideration to embedding mindfulness activities within a subject and possibly over an extended period to ensure empathy is maintained.

#### **Conflict of interest statement**

#### None declared.

#### References

Beddoe, A. E., & Murphy, S. O. (2004). Does mindfulness decrease stress and foster empathy among nursing students? *Journal of Nursing Education*, 43(7), 305–312.

Irving, J. A., Dobkin, P. L., & Park, J. (2009). Cultivating mindfulness in health care professionals: A review of empirical studies of mindfulness-based stress reduction (MBSR). Complementary Therapies in Clinical Practice, 15(2), 61–66.

Hassed, C. et al. (2009). Enhancing the health of medical students: Outcomes of an integrated mindfulness and lifestyle program. Advances in Health Sciences Education, 14(3), 387–398.

Shapiro, S. et al. (2005). Mindfulness-based stress reduction for health care professionals: Results from a randomized trial. *International Journal of Stress Management*, 12(2), 164–176.

Darling, C. A. et al. (2007). College student stress: The influence of interpersonal relationships on sense of coherence. Stress and Health, 23(4), 215–229.

Candy, B. et al., (2011). Interventions for supporting informal caregivers of patients in the terminal phase of a disease. Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews(9).

Kabat-Zinn, J. (2016). The stress reduction clinic. *Mindfulness*, 1–2.
Hassed, C. (2016). Mindful learning: Why attention matters in education. *International Journal of School & Educational Psychology*, 4(1), 52–60.

Mrazek, M. D. et al. (2013). Mindfulness training improves working memory capacity and GRE performance while reducing mind wandering. *Psychol Sci*, 24(5), 776–781.

Napoli, M., & Bonifas, R. (2011). From theory toward empathic self-care: Creating a mindful classroom for social work students. Social Work Education, 30(6), 635–649. Grant, L. (2014). Hearts and minds: aspects of empathy and wellbeing in social work students. *Social Work Education*, 33(3), 338–352.

 Hojat, M. et al. (2013). Empathy and health care quality. American Journal of Medical Quality: the Official Journal of the American College of Medical Quality, 28(1), 6.
Spiro, H. (2009). Commentary: The practice of empathy. Academic Medicine, 84(9),

1177–1179.

- Colliver, J. A. et al. (2010). Reports of the decline of empathy during medical education are greatly exaggerated: A reexamination of the research. *Academic Medicine*, 85(4), 588–593.
- Larson, E. B., & Yao, X. (2005). Clinical empathy as emotional labor in the patientphysician relationship. Jama, 293(9), 1100–1106.
- Hegazi, I., & Wilson, I. (2013). Maintaining empathy in medical school: It is possible. Medical Teacher, 35(12), 1002–1008.
- Stepien, K. A., & Baernstein, A. (2006). Educating for empathy. Journal of General Internal Medicine, 21(5), 524–530.
- Hojat, M. et al. (2002). Empathy in medical students as related to academic performance, clinical competence and gender. *Medical Education*, 36(6), 522–527.
- Hong, M. et al. (2012). Changes of empathy in medical college and medical school students: 1-year follow up study. BMC Medical Education, 12(1), 1.
- Epstein, R.M. and R.L. Street JR, Patient-centered communication in cancer care: promoting healing and reducing suffering. 2007.
- Wilson, S. E., Prescott, J., & Becket, G. (2012). Empathy levels in first-and third-year students in health and non-health disciplines. *American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education*, 76, 2.
- Birnie, K., Speca, M., & Carlson, L. E. (2010). Exploring self-compassion and empathy in the context of mindfulness-based stress reduction (MBSR). *Stress and Health*, 26(5), 359–371.
- Lamothe, M. et al. (2016). Outcomes of MBSR or MBSR-based interventions in health care providers: A systematic review with a focus on empathy and emotional competencies. *Complementary therapies in Medicine*, 24, 19–28.
- Carson, S. H., & Langer, E. J. (2006). Mindfulness and self-acceptance. Journal of Rational-emotive and Cognitive-Behavior Therapy, 24(1), 29-43.
- Charon, R. (2007). What to do with stories: The sciences of narrative medicine. Canadian Family Physician, 53(8), 1265–1267.
- Bensing, J., Rimondini, M., & Visser, A. (2013). What patients want. Patient Education and counseling, 90(3), 287–290.
- Parry, R. (2008). Are interventions to enhance communication performance in allied health professionals effective, and how should they be delivered? Direct and indirect evidence. *Patient Education and Counseling*, 73(2), 186–195.
- Street, R. L. et al. (2009). How does communication heal? Pathways linking clinicianpatient communication to health outcomes. *Patient Education and counseling*, 74(3), 295–301.
- Stein-Parbury, J. (2014). Patient and Person Sydney: Churchill Livingstone. Adams, J. et al. (2012). Traditional, complementary and integrative medicine: An international reader. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Barnes, S. et al. (2012). Enhancing Patient-Professional Communication About End-of-Life Issues in Life-Limiting Conditions: A Critical Review of the Literature. *Journal* of Pain and Symptom Management, 44(6), 866–879.
- Kitai, E. et al. (1998). Use of complementary and alternative medicine among primary care patients. Family Practice, 15(5), 411–414.
- Fonnebo, V. et al. (2007). Researching complementary and alternative treatments the gatekeepers are not at home. *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, 7(1), 7.
- Kim, J.-H. et al. (2012). The use of complementary and alternative medicine (CAM) in children: A telephone-based survey in Korea. BMC complementary and alternative

Medicine, 12(1), 46.

- Michlig, M., Ausfeld-Hafter, B., & Busato, A. (2008). Patient satisfaction with primary care: A comparison between conventional care and traditional Chinese medicine. *Complementary therapies in Medicine*, 16(6), 350–358.
- Bishop, F. L., Yardley, L., & Lewith, G. T. (2010). Why consumers maintain complementary and alternative medicine use: A qualitative study. *The Journal of Alternative and Complementary Medicine*, 16(2), 175–182.
- General Medical Council (GMC) (2012). The State of Medical Education and Practice in the UK.
- Health Care Complaints Commission (2015). Health Care Complaints Commission Annual Report 2014–2015: Sydney. p. 01–65.
- Iedema, R.A.M.M. (2012). Patient-Clinician Communication: An Overview of Relevant Research and Policy Literatures,: Sydney. p. 1-211.
- Hojat, M. (2007). Empathy in patient care. Antecedents, development, measurement, and outcomes New York, NY: Springer.
- Fields, S. K. et al. (2011). Measuring empathy in healthcare profession students using the Jefferson Scale of Physician empathy: Health provider – student version. Journal of Interprofessional Care, 25(4), 287–293.
- Fjortoft, N., Van Winkle, L. J., & Hojat, M. (2011). Measuring empathy in pharmacy students. American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education, 75, 6.
- Williams, J., & Stickley, T. (2010). Empathy and nurse education. Nurse Education Today, 30(8), 752–755.
- Slavik, C. (2014). An exploration of the impact of course specific mindfulness based practices in the university classroom. *Relational Child & Youth Care Practice*, 27, 1.

Diefenderfer, A. B. (2015). Contemplative practices in higher education: Powerful methods to transform teaching and learning by Daniel P. Barbezat and Mirabai Bush (review). *The Review of Higher Education*, 39(1), 153–156.

- Coutinho, J. F., Silva, P. O., & Decety, J. (2014). Neurosciences, empathy, and healthy interpersonal relationships: Recent findings and implications for counseling psychology. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 61(4), 541–548.
- Parkin, T., de Looy, A., & Farrand, P. (2014). Greater professional empathy leads to higher agreement about decisions made in the consultation. *Patient Education and Counseling*, 96(2), 144–150.
- Hsiao, C. Y., Tsai, Y. F., & Kao, Y. C. (2013). Psychometric properties of a Chinese version of the Jefferson scale of empathy-health profession students. *Journal of Psychiatric* and Mental Health Nursing, 20(10), 866–873.
- Kataoka, H. U. et al. (2009). Measurement of empathy among Japanese medical students: psychometrics and score differences by gender and level of medical education. Academic Medicine, 84(9), 1192–1197.
- Wen, D. et al. (2013). Empathy in Chinese medical students: Psychometric characteristics and differences by gender and year of medical education. BMC Medical Education, 13(1), 1–6.
- Kataoka, H. U. et al. (2009). Measurement of empathy among Japanese medical students: psychometrics and score differences by gender and level of medical education. *Academic Medicine*, 84.
- Hojat, M. et al. (2009). The devil is in the third year: A longitudinal study of erosion of empathy in medical school. Academic Medicine, 84(9), 1182–1191.
- Hojat, M. et al. (2004). An empirical study of decline in empathy in medical school. *Medical Education*, 38.
- Campbell, K. (2012). Empathy should be the basis of patient care.
- Krznaric, R. (2014). Empathy: A handbook for revolution Sydney: Random House. Oliver, B. (2011). Assuring graduate outcomes Australia: Australian Learning and Teaching Council: Strawbervy Hills.